

Federal Advisory Committee Act

Clean Air Act Advisory Committee

**Virtual Meeting
March 15, 2021**

Welcome & Opening Remarks

Ms. Shanika Whitehurst, the Designated Federal Official (DFO), opened the meeting by taking roll. A list of attendees is provided in Attachment 1. Due to concerns about safety regarding the coronavirus, this Clean Air Act Advisory Committee (CAAAC) meeting was held remotely via Microsoft Teams. Ms. Whitehurst also noted that a summary of this virtual meeting will be available online at EPA’s CAAAC website (<https://www.epa.gov/caaac>).

Virtual Meeting Agenda

Time	Item	Presenters/Facilitators
2:00 - 2:05pm	Welcome and Start of Meeting	Shanika Whitehurst, DFO and John Shoaff, Office Director, Office of Air Policy and Program Support
2:05 - 2:35pm	Introduction of Speakers/Discussion	John Shoaff
2:35 - 2:45pm	Questions and Answers	
2:45 - 2:55pm	Public Comments	
2:55 - 3:00pm	Close of Meeting	Shanika Whitehurst

Mr. John Shoaff (EPA) explained that the purpose of the meeting was to facilitate a “meet and greet” with the new leadership team at the Office of Air and Radiation (OAR) and would include time for questions and public comment.

Introduction of Speakers/Discussion

Mr. Shoaff invited each of the new appointees to introduce themselves.

Mr. Tomás Carbonell, the new Deputy Assistant Administrator for Stationary Sources, began by emphasizing that as a former member of CAAAC, he appreciates the perspectives and expertise that members bring to the table, and he is looking forward to hearing from everyone and working together. He described his background studying science and engineering at North Carolina State University, then transitioning into environmental law through an internship in Washington, D.C. and later at law school. In his career at the Environmental Defense Fund, he worked with a broad array of partners and stakeholders on rulemaking and litigation. He added that he is humbled and inspired to work in public service and be part of the Biden Administration’s efforts to prioritize

climate change, environmental health, and environmental justice while following the law and staying grounded in science.

Ms. Alejandra Nunez, the new Deputy Assistant Administrator for Mobile Sources, reiterated the sentiment that CAAAC members have provided valuable input to EPA in the past, and she is looking forward to receiving the recommendations in the 50th anniversary report being prepared. She explained that the OAR leadership team is still in a transitional phase, but they are looking forward to beginning to implement the Biden Administration's agenda. She described her background working at the Sierra Club on advocacy related to climate change regulations as well as her experience in transportation, including vehicle standards. Previously, she worked on public-private partnerships at the World Bank and was an associate at a law firm. Her priorities include air quality, public health, climate change, and environmental justice, and she is looking forward to hearing the perspectives of CAAAC members as well as EPA's expert staff on how to best accomplish President Biden's environmental goals.

Ms. Eunjung Kim, special assistant to OAR, described her background in engineering and experience with the Army Corps of Engineers as well as how she heard a lot about the effects of climate change on people across the country while on the campaign trail in 2020. She emphasized that she is excited to be a part of this team and Administration.

Mr. Carbonell reiterated that the leadership team is still getting started, and they are excited about Administrator Michael Regan's recent confirmation by the Senate. He noted that they are especially interested in hearing questions and thoughts about how EPA can best work with the CAAAC moving forward.

Note: Mr. Joseph Goffman, the Acting Assistant Administrator and Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator, joined late and introduced himself during the Questions and Answers portion of the meeting.

Questions and Answers

Mr. Shoaff moderated the questions and answers portion of the meeting.

Mr. Tim Hunt stated that in the past, the group has talked about how to deal with the carbon neutrality of biomass and the regulatory uncertainty around carbon accounting. He said he was pleased to hear Mr. Carbonell mention the importance of using good science and noted that the American Wood Council has provided information and research to EPA in the past and would be happy to do so again. He asked what stakeholders can do to ensure that EPA's information needs are being met and know what questions they have. Mr. Carbonell agreed that biomass is a complex topic and that it is important to approach the law and the science carefully. He noted that the EPA always welcomes input from the entire spectrum of stakeholders, including technical and policy information, and he expects that will continue with the new Administration. Ms. Nunez agreed and noted that they are still in the transition period, but they are listening to

the priorities that different groups have and they welcome information that people send their way.

Ms. Shannon Broome stated that one of the most valuable aspects of the CAAAC is the practical experience that members have with implementing different rules and regulations, which is something that regulators often are not as familiar with. She said she would like to see the CAAAC take a more active role in advising EPA on how to implement different policy goals to ensure their plans are accurate and workable in practice. Mr. Carbonell agreed that the diverse perspectives and on the ground experience of CAAAC members are very valuable, and as a former member he wants to make sure the EPA leverages that. Ms. Broome responded that in the past, an Assistant Administrator would give a report to the group and then leave very quickly without hearing much feedback, and in the future, more should be done in order to truly leverage members' expertise.

Ms. Mary Peveto expressed Oregon's support for the new medium- and heavy-duty truck rules and noted that she was happy to see Mr. Carbonell working for the EPA now after being a member of the CAAAC. She explained that transportation continues to be a significant contributor to carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions as well as air pollution and environmental justice concerns, in part because of freight movement and a continued reliance on diesel. She stated that she sees an opportunity to decrease these emissions because COVID-19 and other factors have resulted in a massive decrease in transport, and she would like to see how the EPA can partner with states and other parties to pursue a big investment in public transit, such as high speed rail. She added that her organization did a study of diesel emissions from railroads and found that Amtrak is the worst offender, and it would be very valuable to improve passenger rail and interstate transit options in terms for air quality. She concluded by pointing out that although it is valuable to pursue cleaner cars, it is equally if not more important to ask how we get people out of cars. Ms. Nunez thanked Ms. Peveto for her feedback and emphasized that they will be looking at many options and working with a variety of people to benefit communities.

Mr. Bob Meyers acknowledged that being a new appointee at EPA right now must feel like "drinking from a firehose," and noted that there are a lot of big issues being dealt with on the mobile sources side, including the California waiver and the ACE rule. He asked Ms. Nunez whether she has any plans going forward in the heavy-duty sector related to outreach and engagement. Ms. Nunez responded that the EPA was going to issue a rule under the previous administration, but it did not go forward. She stated that this is one of the items that the office will be examining alongside expert staff, and that addressing heavy-duty emissions is a priority. Mr. Meyers followed up to ask whether greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions were a priority for heavy-duty vehicles, and Ms. Nunez replied that the key issue right now is the NO_x emissions standard, but they may also be considering GHGs.

Mr. Clay Pope stated that each administration varies in how much they rely on the CAAAC, and there wasn't much activity in 2020 other than the 50th anniversary report due to the pandemic. He recommended that if the EPA is going to seek advice from the CAAAC, they should do so on

more discrete and specific issues compared to the broadness of the report. He also asked whether any of the EPA staff have heard about the initiative to install 600,000 vehicle charging stations nationwide, and whether the Department of Transportation or the EPA would be managing that program. Ms. Nunez answered that the EPA's job will be to look at emissions related to a transition to more electric vehicles, and she indicated that the EPA likely did not have the authority to be directly involved in infrastructure like that described. She noted that as they get more information, they will do their best to relay it to everyone.

At this point, Mr. Goffman joined the meeting, and Mr. Shoaff invited him to introduce himself to everyone.

Mr. Goffman apologized for being late and explained that he had been delayed by Administrator Regan's inaugural staff meeting. He relayed Administrator Regan's message to the CAAAC: he is committed to ensuring that the EPA carries out, to the best of its ability, President Biden's environmental, climate, and environmental justice priorities, by using the best science, ensuring public participation from all stakeholders, and ensuring transparency and integrity in decision-making. Mr. Goffman acknowledged that CAAAC has been instrumental for a long time and thanked everyone for their participation.

Ms. Gillian Mittelstaedt stated that she agreed that climate change and environmental justice are two extremely important political and moral challenges. She went on to explain that although it may appear less exciting and urgent, indoor air quality is very important, as 99% of exposure occurs inside homes, schools, workplaces, and cars. She noted that the Clean Air Act does not provide a regulatory framework for the EPA to address this issue, but in the short term, she requests that OAR include this area in its budget and planning so it can be integrated across the various programs. For example, when studying ultrafine particulate matter (PM), it is valuable to consider infiltration rates as they contribute to exposure, risk, and human health. She encouraged the EPA to make sure that the science and policy become integrated on this issue, which will also help address environmental justice and some climate change topics, such as wildfire smoke.

Mr. Andrew Hoekzema thanked the EPA for scheduling this CAAAC meeting and explained that compared to his experience with the previous administrative transition, he is glad to see that so much attention is being paid to the CAAAC so early in President Biden's term. He stated that he hopes this bodes well for the Biden Administration making more extensive use of members' expertise and perspectives. He then brought up the ozone and PM National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) and the decision by the EPA under President Trump to leave the NAAQS unchanged. He asked whether there is discussion about initiating a reconsideration of either of those standards, given the new direction that EPA has taken to stick closer to the required 5-year review period. He added that this is an example of the type of decision or consideration on which it would be appropriate to solicit CAAAC feedback. He noted that although the EPA is not required to consult with the CAAAC like it is with the Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC), members have similar expertise and could be helpful. Mr. Goffman responded that the EPA is reviewing this action, but that he could not elaborate very much, especially since such

decisions are eventually up to the Administrator, and there hasn't been time to discuss it with Administrator Regan yet. However, President Biden did task the agency to look at decisions made under the previous Administration and set priorities, and the ozone and PM NAAQS are under extensive scrutiny. He added that he would love to hear more in the future about how to operationalize Mr. Hoekzema's suggestion that the CAAAC play a role in the NAAQS process.

Ms. Nancy Kruger explained to Mr. Goffman that before he joined, there had been some discussion of how the new Administration could best use the CAAAC and asked him if he had any thoughts on how to accomplish that. Mr. Goffman answered that Administrator Regan has made a commitment for EPA to make full use of its available tools to advance its various priorities. He stated that the EPA would benefit from the group's advice on discrete issues that OAR can address.

Public Comments and Close of Meeting

Mr. Shoaff noted that the end of the meeting was approaching and paused the discussion to allow an opportunity for public comment. Hearing none, he asked whether any of the EPA political leadership had any final remarks and noted that he and Ms. Whitehurst would be happy to receive thoughts, comments, or questions from members at a later time.

Mr. Goffman stated that he wanted to make it clear that the political leadership at EPA is eager to make contact with stakeholders and get going in partnership with the scientific staff. He thanked the CAAAC members for their willingness to participate.

Mr. Carbonell said that it was a pleasure to see everyone and reiterated that this meeting would be the first of many interactions.

Ms. Nunez added that she looked forward to hearing everyone's input and getting help and advice from the CAAAC as they begin to implement priorities alongside staff.

Ms. Kim thanked everyone for coming and stated that she was looking forward to working together.

Ms. Whitehurst thanked the attendees and OAR leadership and reminded CAAAC members that they are working on setting a date for the spring meeting, and she would let them know about that soon. She then adjourned the meeting.

Attachment 1

CAAAC Virtual Meeting Attendance List¹	
Committee Members	
Name	Organization
Adrienne Hollis	Union of Concerned Scientists
Andrew Hoekzema	Capital Area Council of Governments
Bob Meyers	Crowell and Moring
Clay Pope	Consultant
Daniel Nickey	Iowa Waste Reduction Center Business and Community Services
Deborah Brown	American Lung Association
Elizabeth Jacobs	Akwesasne Housing Authority
Eric Massey	APS
Frank Prager	Xcel Energy Inc.
Gail Good	Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources
Gary Jones	Specialty Graphic Imaging Association Foundation
Gillian Mittelstaedt	Tribal Healthy Homes Network
Jason Howanitz	Jefferson County Department of Health
John Booher	Briggs and Stratton
Kimberly Scarborough	Public Service Electric & Gas
Kris Ray	Confederated Tribes of the Colville Reservation
Maria Robinson	Massachusetts House of Representatives
Mary Peveto	Neighbors for Clean Air
Mary Uhl	Western States Air Resources Council
Max Sherman	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory
Michell Hescoc	Evangelical Environmental Network
Nancy Kruger	National Association of Clean Air Agencies
Natalene Cummings	Forest County Potawatomi Community
Robert Hodanbosi	Ohio Environmental Protection Agency
Robert Wyman	Latham and Watkins, LLP, National Climate Coalition
Shannon Broome	Hunton Andres Kurth
Steve Flint	New York Department of Environmental Conservation
Steven Marcus	Rutgers University
Ted Steichen	American Petroleum Institute
Timothy Hunt	American Forest and Paper Association, American Wood Council
TJ Wallington	Ford Motor Company
Veronica Figueroa	Mosaic Fertilizer
William Bahnfleth	Pennsylvania State University

¹ This list of meeting attendees is not comprehensive due to a number of unidentified call-in participants.

CAAAC Virtual Meeting Attendance List²	
Other Attendees	
Name	Organization
Alejandra Nunez	U.S. EPA
Eunjung Kim	U.S. EPA
Joe Goffman	U.S. EPA
John Shoaff	U.S. EPA
Shanika Whitehurst	U.S. EPA
Tomás Carbonell	U.S. EPA
Pat Childers	U.S. EPA
Alex Guillen	(not identified during meeting)
Benjamin Kallen	(not identified during meeting)
Bob Morehouse	(not identified during meeting)
Carolyn Slaughter	(not identified during meeting)
Cheryl Hogue	(not identified during meeting)
Daniel Chartier	(not identified during meeting)
Darcy Wilson	(not identified during meeting)
David Foster	(not identified during meeting)
Dawn Reeves	(not identified during meeting)
Isabel DeLuca	(not identified during meeting)
Jake Kennedy	(not identified during meeting)
John Kinsman	(not identified during meeting)
Kayla McMurry	(not identified during meeting)
Lauren Freeman	(not identified during meeting)
Linda Wilson	(not identified during meeting)
M. Gabriella	(not identified during meeting)
Mike Cammisa	(not identified during meeting)
Monika Chandra	(not identified during meeting)
Rae Cronmiller	(not identified during meeting)
Reid Porter	(not identified during meeting)
Seth Johnson	(not identified during meeting)
Stephen Hepler	(not identified during meeting)
Taylor Bacon	(not identified during meeting)
Tiffany Andersen	(not identified during meeting)
Travis Voyles	(not identified during meeting)
Contractor Support	
Lesley Stobert	SC&A, Inc.
Margaret Overton	SC&A, Inc.

² This list of meeting attendees is not comprehensive due to a number of unidentified call-in participants.