



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF  
ENFORCEMENT AND  
COMPLIANCE ASSURANCE

VIA CERTIFIED MAIL  
RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

VIA EMAIL to [terrance.kutryk@huskyenergy.com](mailto:terrance.kutryk@huskyenergy.com)

**NOV 07 2011**

Lima Refining Company  
Attention: Terrance E. Kutryk, Responsible Corporate Officer  
1150 South Metcalf Street  
Lima, OH 45804

Re: Notice of Violation of Renewable Fuel Standards  
File Number AED/MSEB # 7963

Dear Terrance E. Kutryk:

The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA or we) has commenced an investigation into Lima Refining Company (Lima or you) regarding whether you used invalid Renewable Identification Numbers (RINs) to meet your 2010 Renewable Volume Obligation (RVO) under the Clean Air Act (CAA). Based on the information available to the EPA as a result of this investigation, we have determined that Clean Green Fuels, LLC (Clean Green Fuels) created invalid RINs, and that Lima used some of the RINs created by Clean Green Fuels in an effort to satisfy your 2010 RVO. Use of invalid RINs to satisfy RVOs is a violation of the EPA's regulations governing RINs and renewable fuels. 40 C.F.R. § 80.1460(c).

Section 211(o) of the CAA originally was enacted as part of the Energy Policy Act of 2005 (EPAct), and was amended by the Energy Information and Security Act of 2007 (EISA). The EPA promulgated the original renewable fuels standards regulations (RFS 1) at 40 C.F.R. Part 80, Subpart K to implement EPAct, and subsequently promulgated the current renewable fuels standards regulations (RFS 2) at 40 C.F.R. Part 80, Subpart M to implement EISA. EPAct set the first national renewable fuel mandate in the United States, and required 7.5 billion gallons of renewable fuel to be blended into gasoline by 2012. EISA required the EPA to make several important changes to the original renewable fuels regulations, including increasing the volume of renewable fuel required to be blended into transportation fuel to 36 billion gallons per year by 2022. EISA and the RFS 2 regulations also established new categories of renewable fuel with separate volume requirements, and set new greenhouse gas (GHG) emission reduction thresholds for each separate category of renewable fuel. The RFS 2 regulations lay the foundation to achieve significant reductions of GHG

emissions from the use of renewable fuels, reduce petroleum importation, and encourage the development and expansion of our nation's renewable fuels sector.

The RFS 2 regulations require petroleum refiners and importers (referred to as "obligated parties"), and exporters of renewable fuel to acquire sufficient RINs to demonstrate compliance with their RVOs. The regulations include a credit trading program to facilitate compliance with the renewable fuel standards. The credit trading program allows obligated parties and exporters of renewable fuel to comply with their RVOs through the purchase of RINs.

The RFS 2 regulations provide that no person shall use invalid RINs to meet their RVO, regardless of that person's good faith belief that the RINs were valid at the time they were acquired. 40 C.F.R. §§ 80.1431(b)(2), 80.1460(c)(1). RINs that do not represent renewable fuel are invalid. 40 C.F.R. § 80.1431(a)(1)(vi).

Based on available information, the EPA has determined that Lima used the 1,311,000 invalid RINs identified in Attachment A to meet your 2010 RVO. These RINs are invalid because they do not represent renewable fuel. The company that generated these RINs, Clean Green Fuels, neither produced nor imported any biodiesel as necessary to legally generate these RINs. This determination is based upon the EPA's inspection of the purported production facility and subsequent investigation.

As noted above and detailed in 40 C.F.R. § 80.1431(b), invalid RINs cannot be used for compliance. In view of the EPA's determination that Clean Green Fuels RINs are invalid, any RINs generated by Clean Green Fuels must be removed from your 2010 annual compliance report and a corrected report must be resubmitted. The resubmitted report must include only valid RINs. We request that you make these adjustments and resubmit your annual compliance report within 14 business days after your receipt of this Notice of Violation (NOV). You may contact the EPA Fuels Help Line at (202) 343-9755 if you have questions regarding these reports, including how to make adjustments.

The EPA issues this NOV under Sections 205 and 211 of the CAA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7524 and 7545, for the violations described above. Sections 205 and 211 of the CAA authorize the EPA to assess a civil penalty of up to \$37,500 for every day for each violation, plus the economic benefit or savings resulting from each violation. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7524, 7545(d); *see also* 40 C.F.R. §§ 19.4, 80.1461, 80.1463. In determining an appropriate penalty for violations, the EPA considers the gravity of the violation, the economic benefit or savings (if any) resulting from the violation, the size of your business, your history of compliance with the CAA, actions taken by you to remedy the violation and prevent future violations, the effect of the penalty on your ability to continue in business, and other matters as justice may require. 42 U.S.C. § 7524. This NOV does not create any rights or waive any of your obligations under the CAA, but rather is for the purpose of notifying you of the violations.

We are offering you an opportunity to confer with us about the violations alleged in this NOV. The conference will give you an opportunity to present information on the alleged violations, any efforts you have taken to comply, and the steps you will take to prevent future violations.



The EPA attorney assigned to this matter is Evan M. Belser. He can be reached at (202) 564-6850, Belser.Evan@epa.gov, or at the following address:

Evan M. Belser, Attorney Adviser  
EPA, Air Enforcement Division  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Ariel Rios South Building Room 1111A, Mailcode 2242A  
Washington, D.C. 20460 (20004 for non-USPS couriers)

Contact Mr. Belser to request the conference described above. Any conference should be held within 60 calendar days of your receipt of this NOV. By offering the opportunity for a conference, or participating in one, the EPA does not waive or limit its right to any remedy available under the CAA.

We appreciate your attention to this important matter and look forward to working with you to reach a resolution.

Sincerely,



*PA* Phillip A. Brooks  
Director  
Air Enforcement Division

cc: Matthew W. Morrison, Associate Director, Air Enforcement Division  
Jacqueline Robles Werner, Chief, Mobile Source Enforcement Branch  
Jeffrey A. Kodish, Fuels Team Leader, Mobile Source Enforcement Branch

**Attachment A**  
**Notice of Violation of Renewable Fuel Standards, File Number AED/MSEB # 7963**

**List of Invalid Renewable Identification Numbers Lima Refining Company  
Retired for Compliance Purposes**

22010346084000010421520000000100008250	22010346084000010851520000000100009750
22010346084000010431520000000100007500	22010346084000010861520000000100009750
22010346084000010441520000000100010500	22010346084000010871520000000100007500
22010346084000010451520000000100012000	22010346084000010881520000000100007500
22010346084000010461520000000100006000	22010346084000010891520000000100006750
22010346084000010471520000000100010500	22010346084000010901520000000100006750
22010346084000010481520000000100010500	22010346084000010911520000000100006000
22010346084000010491520000000100010500	22010346084000010921520000000100012000
22010346084000010501520000000100008250	22010346084000010931520000000100012000
22010346084000010511520000000100006000	22010346084000010941520000000100012000
22010346084000010521520000000100006000	22010346084000010951520000000100011250
22010346084000010531520000000100012000	22010346084000010961520000000100011250
22010346084000010541520000000100012000	22010346084000010971520000000100010500
22010346084000010551520000000100009750	22010346084000010981520000000100010500
22010346084000010561520000000100009750	22010346084000010991520000000100007500
22010346084000010571520000000100007500	22010346084000011001520000000100006000
22010346084000010581520000000100007500	22010346084000011011520000000100006000
22010346084000010591520000000100007500	22010346084000011021520000000100012000
22010346084000010601520000000100009000	22010346084000011031520000000100012000
22010346084000010611520000000100009000	22010346084000011041520000000100009750
22010346084000010621520000000100009750	22010346084000011051520000000100009750
22010346084000010631520000000100010500	22010346084000011061520000000100007500
22010346084000010641520000000100010500	22010346084000011071520000000100007500
22010346084000010651520000000100007500	22010346084000011081520000000100007500
22010346084000010661520000000100006000	22010346084000011091520000000100009000
22010346084000010671520000000100006000	22010346084000011101520000000100009000
22010346084000010681520000000100012000	22010346084000011111520000000100009750
22010346084000010691520000000100012000	22010346084000011121520000000100010500
22010346084000010701520000000100009750	22010346084000011131520000000100010500
22010346084000010711520000000100009750	22010346084000011141520000000100007500
22010346084000010721520000000100007500	22010346084000011151520000000100009750
22010346084000010731520000000100007500	22010346084000011161520000000100009750
22010346084000010741520000000100007500	22010346084000011171520000000100012000
22010346084000010751520000000100009000	22010346084000011181520000000100012000
22010346084000010761520000000100009000	22010346084000011191520000000100009750
22010346084000010771520000000100009750	22010346084000011201520000000100009750
22010346084000010781520000000100010500	22010346084000011211520000000100007500
22010346084000010791520000000100010500	22010346084000011221520000000100007500
22010346084000010801520000000100007500	22010346084000011231520000000100006750
22010346084000010811520000000100009750	22010346084000011241520000000100008250
22010346084000010821520000000100009750	22010346084000011251520000000100007500
22010346084000010831520000000100012000	22010346084000011261520000000100010500
22010346084000010841520000000100012000	22010346084000011271520000000100012000



22010346084000011281520000000100006000  
22010346084000011291520000000100010500  
22010346084000011301520000000100010500  
22010346084000011311520000000100010500  
22010346084000011321520000000100008250  
22010346084000011331520000000100006000  
22010346084000011341520000000100006000  
22010346084000011351520000000100012000  
22010346084000011361520000000100012000  
22010346084000021371520001016500010500  
22010346084000021381520000000100007500  
22010346084000021391520000000100009750  
22010346084000021401520000000100009750  
22010346084000021411520000000100012000  
22010346084000021421520000000100012000  
22010346084000021431520000000100009750  
22010346084000021441520000000100010500  
22010346084000021451520000000100008250  
22010346084000021461520000000100007500  
22010346084000021471520000000100010500  
22010346084000021481520000000100012000  
22010346084000021491520000000100006000  
22010346084000021501520000000100010500  
22010346084000021511520000000100010500  
22010346084000021521520000000100010500  
22010346084000021531520000000100008250  
22010346084000021541520000000100006000  
22010346084000021551520000000100006000  
22010346084000021561520000000100012000  
22010346084000021571520000000100012000  
22010346084000021581520000000100009750  
22010346084000021591520000000100009750  
22010346084000021601520000000100007500  
22010346084000021611520000000100007500  
22010346084000021621520000000100007500  
22010346084000021631520000000100009000  
22010346084000021641520000000100009000  
22010346084000021651520000000100009750  
22010346084000021661520000000100010500  
22010346084000021671520000000100010500  
22010346084000021681520000000100010500  
22010346084000021691520000000100007500  
22010346084000021701520000000100006000  
22010346084000021711520000000100006000  
22010346084000021721520000000100012000  
22010346084000021731520000000100012000

22010346084000021741520000000100009750  
22010346084000021751520000000100009750  
22010346084000021761520000000100007500  
22010346084000021771520000000100007500  
22010346084000021781520000000100007500  
22010346084000021791520000000100009000  
22010346084000021801520000000100009000  
22010346084000021821520000000100010500  
22010346084000021831520000000100010500  
22010346084000021841520000000100007500  
22010346084000010421520000000100008250  
22010346084000010431520000000100007500  
22010346084000010441520000000100010500  
22010346084000010451520000000100012000  
22010346084000010461520000000100006000  
22010346084000010471520000000100010500  
22010346084000010481520000000100010500  
22010346084000010491520000000100010500  
22010346084000010501520000000100008250  
22010346084000010511520000000100006000  
22010346084000010521520000000100006000  
22010346084000010531520000000100012000  
22010346084000010541520000000100012000  
22010346084000010551520000000100009750  
22010346084000010561520000000100009750  
22010346084000010571520000000100007500  
22010346084000010581520000000100007500  
22010346084000010591520000000100007500  
22010346084000010601520000000100009000  
22010346084000010611520000000100009000  
22010346084000010621520000000100009750  
22010346084000010631520000000100010500  
22010346084000010641520000000100010500  
22010346084000010651520000000100007500  
22010346084000010661520000000100006000  
22010346084000010671520000000100006000  
22010346084000010681520000000100012000  
22010346084000010691520000000100012000  
22010346084000010701520000000100009750  
22010346084000010711520000000100009750  
22010346084000010721520000000100007500  
22010346084000010731520000000100007500  
22010346084000010741520000000100007500  
22010346084000010751520000000100009000  
22010346084000010761520000000100009000  
22010346084000010771520000000100009750



22010346084000010781520000000100010500  
22010346084000010791520000000100010500  
22010346084000010801520000000100007500  
22010346084000010811520000000100009750  
22010346084000010821520000000100009750  
22010346084000010831520000000100012000  
22010346084000010841520000000100012000  
22010346084000010851520000000100009750  
22010346084000010861520000000100009750  
22010346084000010871520000000100007500  
22010346084000010881520000000100007500  
22010346084000010891520000000100006750  
22010346084000010901520000000100006750  
22010346084000010911520000000100006000  
22010346084000010921520000000100012000  
22010346084000010931520000000100012000  
22010346084000010941520000000100012000  
22010346084000010951520000000100011250  
22010346084000010961520000000100011250  
22010346084000010971520000000100010500  
22010346084000010981520000000100010500  
22010346084000010991520000000100007500  
22010346084000011001520000000100006000  
22010346084000011011520000000100006000  
22010346084000011021520000000100012000  
22010346084000011031520000000100012000  
22010346084000011041520000000100009750  
22010346084000011051520000000100009750  
22010346084000011061520000000100007500  
22010346084000011071520000000100007500  
22010346084000011081520000000100007500  
22010346084000011091520000000100009000  
22010346084000011101520000000100009000  
22010346084000011111520000000100009750  
22010346084000011121520000000100010500  
22010346084000011131520000000100010500  
22010346084000011141520000000100007500  
22010346084000011151520000000100009750  
22010346084000011161520000000100009750  
22010346084000011171520000000100012000  
22010346084000011181520000000100012000  
22010346084000011191520000000100009750  
22010346084000011201520000000100009750  
22010346084000011211520000000100007500  
22010346084000011221520000000100007500  
22010346084000011231520000000100006750

22010346084000011241520000000100008250  
22010346084000011251520000000100007500  
22010346084000011261520000000100010500  
22010346084000011271520000000100012000  
22010346084000011281520000000100006000  
22010346084000011291520000000100010500  
22010346084000011301520000000100010500  
22010346084000011311520000000100010500  
22010346084000011321520000000100008250  
22010346084000011331520000000100006000  
22010346084000011341520000000100006000  
22010346084000011351520000000100012000  
22010346084000011361520000000100012000  
22010346084000021371520001016500010500  
22010346084000021381520000000100007500  
22010346084000021391520000000100009750  
22010346084000021401520000000100009750  
22010346084000021411520000000100012000  
22010346084000021421520000000100012000  
22010346084000021431520000000100009750  
22010346084000021441520000000100010500  
22010346084000021451520000000100008250  
22010346084000021461520000000100007500  
22010346084000021471520000000100010500  
22010346084000021481520000000100012000  
22010346084000021491520000000100006000  
22010346084000021501520000000100010500  
22010346084000021511520000000100010500  
22010346084000021521520000000100010500  
22010346084000021531520000000100008250  
22010346084000021541520000000100006000  
22010346084000021551520000000100006000  
22010346084000021561520000000100012000  
22010346084000021571520000000100012000  
22010346084000021581520000000100009750  
22010346084000021591520000000100009750  
22010346084000021601520000000100007500  
22010346084000021611520000000100007500  
22010346084000021621520000000100007500  
22010346084000021631520000000100009000  
22010346084000021641520000000100009000  
22010346084000021651520000000100009750  
22010346084000021661520000000100010500  
22010346084000021671520000000100010500  
22010346084000021681520000000100010500  
22010346084000021691520000000100007500

22010346084000021701520000000100006000  
22010346084000021711520000000100006000  
22010346084000021721520000000100012000  
22010346084000021731520000000100012000  
22010346084000021741520000000100009750  
22010346084000021751520000000100009750  
22010346084000021761520000000100007500

22010346084000021771520000000100007500  
22010346084000021781520000000100007500  
22010346084000021791520000000100009000  
22010346084000021801520000000100009000  
22010346084000021821520000000100010500  
22010346084000021831520000000100010500  
22010346084000021841520000000100007500