

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

STATE OF NEW YORK, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, STATE OF CONNECTICUT, STATE OF ILLINOIS, STATE OF MARYLAND, COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, STATE OF MINNESOTA, STATE OF NEW JERSEY, STATE OF NEW MEXICO, STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, STATE OF OREGON, COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, STATE OF RHODE ISLAND, STATE OF VERMONT, COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, STATE OF WASHINGTON, STATE OF WISCONSIN, DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA and the CITY OF NEW YORK,

Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY; ANDREW WHEELER as Administrator of the UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,

Respondents.

No. 21-1026

PETITION FOR REVIEW

Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1) (Clean Air Act § 307(b)(1)), Rule 15 of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure, and D.C. Circuit Rule 15, the States of New York, California, Connecticut, Illinois, Maryland, Minnesota, New Jersey, New Mexico, North Carolina, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Washington, and

Wisconsin, the Commonwealths of Massachusetts, Pennsylvania, and Virginia, the District of Columbia, and the City of New York (collectively, Petitioners) hereby petition this Court for review of the final action of Respondents United States Environmental Protection Agency and Administrator Andrew R. Wheeler, in his official capacity, set forth in the Federal Register notice published at 85 Fed. Reg. 84,130 (December 23, 2020) and titled “Increasing Consistency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process.”

Dated: January 19, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

FOR THE STATE OF NEW YORK

LETITIA JAMES

Attorney General

STEVEN C. WU

Deputy Solicitor General

/s/ Gavin G. McCabe¹

GAVIN G. McCABE

ANDREW G. FRANK

Assistant Attorneys General

Environmental Protection Bureau

28 Liberty Street, 19th Floor

New York, NY 10005

(212) 416-8469

gavin.mccabe@ag.ny.gov

¹ Counsel for the State of New York represents that the other parties listed in the signature blocks on this document consent to this filing.

FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

XAVIER BECERRA

Attorney General

/s/ Erin Ganahl

ERIN GANAHL

MICAELA HARMS

JONATHAN A. WIENER

Deputy Attorneys General

DAVID A. ZONANA

MYUNG J. PARK

Supervising Deputy Attorneys General

EDWARD H. OCHOA

ROBERT W. BYRNE

Senior Assistant Attorneys General

California Department of Justice

1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor

Oakland, CA 94612

(510) 622-2100

erin.ganahl@doj.ca.gov

*Counsel for the State of California by
and through the California Air*

*Resources Board and Xavier Becerra,
Attorney General*

FOR THE STATE OF
CONNECTICUT

WILLIAM TONG

ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Scott N. Koschwitz

Scott N. Koschwitz

Matthew I. Levine

Assistant Attorneys General

165 Capitol Avenue

Hartford, CT 06106

(860) 808-5250

scott.koschwitz@ct.gov

FOR THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

KWAME RAOUL

Attorney General

/s/ Daniel I. Rottenberg

DANIEL I. ROTTENBERG

MATTHEW J. DUNN

Assistant Attorneys General

Office of the Attorney General

69 W. Washington St., 18th Floor

Chicago, IL 60602

(312) 814-3816

drottenberg@atg.state.il.us

FOR THE STATE OF MARYLAND

BRIAN E. FROSH
Attorney General of Maryland

/s/ Joshua M. Segal
Joshua M. Segal
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
200 St. Paul Place
Baltimore, MD 21202
(410) 576-6446
jsegal@oag.state.md.us

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
MASSACHUSETTS

MAURA HEALEY
Attorney General

/s/ David S. Frankel
DAVID S. FRANKEL
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Protection Division
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
Boston, MA 02108
(617) 963-2294
david.frankel@mass.gov

FOR THE STATE OF MINNESOTA

KEITH ELLISON
Attorney General

/s/ Peter N. Surdo
Peter N. Surdo
Special Assistant Attorney General
Minnesota Attorney General's Office
445 Minnesota Street
Town Square Tower Suite 1400
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55101
(651) 757-1061
Peter.Surdo@ag.state.mn.us

FOR THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY

GURBIR S. GREWAL
Attorney General

/s/ Lisa J. Morelli
LISA J. MORELLI
Deputy Attorney General
New Jersey Division of Law
25 Market Street
Trenton, New Jersey 08625
Tel: (609) 376-2745
Email: Lisa.Morelli@law.njoag.gov

FOR THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO

HECTOR BALDERAS
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Bill Grantham

Bill Grantham
Assistant Attorney General
Consumer & Environmental Protection
Div.
New Mexico Office of the Attorney
General
201 Third Street NW, Suite 300
Albuquerque, NM 87102
Tel: (505) 717-3520
wgrantham@nmag.gov

FOR THE STATE OF NORTH
CAROLINA

JOSHUA H. STEIN
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Amy L. Bircher

AMY L. BIRCHER
FRANCISCO J. BENZONI
Special Deputy Attorneys General
North Carolina Department of Justice
114 W. Edenton Street
Raleigh, NC 27603
(919) 716-6600
abircher@ncdoj.gov
fbenzoni@ncdoj.gov
Counsel for the State of North Carolina

FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
Attorney General

/s/ Paul Garrahan

Paul Garrahan
Attorney-in-Charge
Steve Novick
Special Assistant Attorney General
Natural Resources Section
Oregon Department of Justice
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301-4096
(503) 947-4593
Paul.Garrahan@doj.state.or.us
Steve.Novick@doj.state.or.us

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
PENNSYLVANIA

JOSH SHAPIRO
Attorney General
MICHAEL J. FISCHER
Chief Deputy Attorney General

/s/ Ann R. Johnston

Ann R. Johnston
Senior Deputy Attorney General
Pennsylvania Office of the Attorney
General
Strawberry Square
Harrisburg, PA 17120
(717) 705-6938
ajohnston@attorneygeneral.gov

FOR THE STATE OF RHODE
ISLAND

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General

/s/ Gregory S. Schultz
GREGORY S. SCHULTZ
Special Assistant Attorney General
RI Office of Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
(401) 274-4400
gschultz@riag.ri.gov

FOR THE STATE OF VERMONT

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.
Attorney General

/s/ Nicholas F. Persampieri
NICHOLAS F. PERSAMPIERI
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609
(802) 828-3171
nick.persampieri@vermont.gov

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
VIRGINIA

MARK R. HERRING
Attorney General

PAUL KUGELMAN, JR.
Senior Assistant Attorney General,
Chief, Environmental Section

/s/ Caitlin C. G. O'Dwyer
CAITLIN C. G. O'DWYER
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
202 North 9th Street
Richmond, Virginia 23219
Tel: (804) 786-1780
godwyer@oag.state.va.us
*Attorneys for Petitioner
Commonwealth of Virginia*

FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
Attorney General

/s/ Emily C. Nelson
Emily C. Nelson
Assistant Attorney General
Washington State Attorney General's
Office
PO Box 40117
Olympia, WA 98504
(360) 586-4607
emily.nelson@atg.wa.gov

FOR THE STATE OF WISCONSIN

JOSHUA L. KAUL
ATTORNEY GENERAL

/s/ Lorraine C. Stoltzfus

LORRAINE C. STOLTZFUS
Assistant Attorney General
Wisconsin Department of Justice
Post Office Box 7857
Madison, WI 53707-7857
(608) 266-9226
stoltzfuslc@doj.state.wi.us
Counsel for the State of Wisconsin

FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

KARL A. RACINE
Attorney General

/s/ Loren AliKhan

LOREN L. ALIKHAN
Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General for the
District of Columbia
400 6th Street, NW, Suite 8100
Washington, D.C. 20001
Tel: (202) 727-6287
Email: Loren.AliKhan@dc.gov

FOR THE CITY OF NEW YORK

JAMES E. JOHNSON
New York Corporation Counsel

/s/ Christopher G. King

CHRISTOPHER G. KING
ALICE R. BAKER
Senior Counsels
SAMANTHA G. PELTZ
Special Assistant Corporation Counsel
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356 2074
cking@law.nyc.gov

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that pursuant to D.C. Circuit Rule 15(a), a copy of the foregoing Petition for Review was served on January 19, 2021 by first class mail, postage prepaid on the following:

Andrew Wheeler, Administrator
Office of the Administrator (1101A)
Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20460

Jeffrey A. Rosen
Acting Attorney General of the United States
U.S. Department of Justice
950 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20530

Correspondence Control Unit
Office of General Counsel (2311)
United States Environmental Protection Agency
William Jefferson Clinton Federal Building
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20460

/s/ Gavin G. McCabe

Gavin G. McCabe